

## 新儒學派의 社會的 背景

(Social Background of Early Yi Dynasty Neo-Confucianists)

Edward W. Wagner  
Harvard University

In an article published three years ago, a leading Korean historian wrote:

The political world of the Yi dynasty was dominated by the sarim 士林. The sarim force began to take shape early in the dynasty, and during the period from Sŏngjong through Chungjong's reign (1469-1544) members of this group came to play an increasingly active role in the nation's political life. However, each time it flexed its strength, the sarim suffered cruel purge at the hands of the non-sarim forces. Nevertheless, by the end of Myŏngjong's reign or early in that of his successor Sŏnjo [ca. 1565-1575], the political scene had taken on an exclusively sarim coloration and, in fact, there no longer existed any counterforce that might impede the growing dominance of the sarim. In the period of the 'literati purges' [ca. 1480-1565] the sarim had occupied the position of lower ranking officials not long emerged from the examination process, who make the censoring bodies the principal arena of their activities. But from the reign of Sŏnjo (1567-1608) the sarim force was in full possession of the higher level positions in the government, including even the High State

Councillor and Board Minister posts. From their vantage points in the censoring bodies during the period of the literati purges, the sarim had launched a fierce attack on the non-sarim forces -- the high state councillors and the six board ministers. The best example of this sarim assault against those who held the highest administrative posts in the government is found in the activities of the young, lower ranking literati led by Cho Kwang-jo in [the years 1515-1519 of] Chungjong's reign.<sup>1</sup>

This writer does not go on to characterize the "sarim force" in terms, for example, of socio-economic or regional background, and we are left only with the strong implication that the sarim (in their formative stage) are to be found in the offices of the three agencies (samsa) that comprised the censoring bodies and, accordingly, among the victims of the four literati purges (1498, 1504, 1519, 1545). The non-sarim forces, on the other hand, are here characterized as the occupants of the highest positions in the central government -- the high state councillor and board minister posts.

A recent survey history of Korea also assigns the same domi-

- 
1. Song Ch'an-sik 宋贊植, "Chosŏn-jo sarim chŏngch'i ŭi kwŏllyŏk kujo -- chŏllang kwa samsa rŭl chungsim ŭro 朝鮮朝 士林政治의 權力構造 -- 銓郎과 三司를 中心으로 (The structural aspect of political power under sarim rule in the Yi dynasty -- with a focus on the three censoring bodies and on the positions of section chief in the Board of Personnel), Kyŏngje sahak 2 (Jan. 1978), pp. 134-135.

nant role to the "sarim force" but, in contrast, describes the character and composition of the sarim in quite specific detail, as follows:

The ruling elite structure of the Yi dynasty began to show signs of serious disturbance from the latter years of the 15th century. This phenomenon is closely related to the emergence on the national political scene of sarim from areas outside the capital.

From the founding of the dynasty in 1392 the dominant figures in the central government on the whole had been the so-called bureaucrat-scholar element ( Kwanhakp'a 官學派 ) consisting of the Dynastic Foundation Merit Subjects and those closely related to them. On the other hand..., there was also a non-serving scholar element (sahakp'a 私學派 ). The former element... occupied the highest government positions and possessed immense agricultural estates, while the latter element, the sarim, which carried on the tradition of the [end of koryŏ loyalist Neo-Confucian scholar] Kil Chae 吉再 and his disciple Kim Suk-cha 金叔滋 ... lacked a base in the political arena of the central government. In the beginning these sarim were simply local intelligentsia of the small and middle landholding class, but following upon the advance into central government position of Kim Chong-jik 金宗直 [son of Kim Suk-cha] under the patronage of King Sŏngjong, many of his disciples

also entered the bureaucracy and created a new force able to contest for power with the established meritorious element (hun' gup'a 勳舊派)....

In the course of the recurrent literati purges... during the half century from 1498-1545, the sarim were harshly suppressed by the established meritorious element, but they did not abandon their struggle. Drawing their strength from their landholdings on which they lived in the countryside, and utilizing the private academies (sŏwŏn 書院) and village contract (hyangyak 鄉約) as a springboard, they rose again to take up positions in the central government bureaucracy.... And ultimately, in the time of Sŏnjo (1567-1608) they drove out the established meritorious element and seized political power.<sup>2</sup>

No doubt from a somewhat different perspective, North Korean historiography takes a similar view of the sarim and their political destiny. The sarim entry in a historical dictionary published in 1971 offers the following explanation:

Sarim: term indicating a group of yangban 兩班 scholars, most of whom came from small and middle landlord background, that constituted a sociopolitical force in the first half the Yi dynasty.... Many Neo-Confucian scholars of this background emerged

2. Kang Chin-ch'öl 姜晉哲, Kang Man-gil 姜萬吉, Kim Chŏng-bae 金貞培, Segye sae pich'un Han'guk ŭi yŏksa 世界史에 비춘 韓國의 歷史 (The history of Korea in the perspective of world history), Seoul: Koryŏ Univ. Press, 1975, pp. 92-93.

from the school of Kil Chae.... When Kim Chong-jik came to occupy important positions in the feudal government toward the end of the 15th century, he secured posts in [the censoring bodies of]... the central government for many sarim scholars of small and middle landlord background, who worked to curb the power of the higher officials and to strengthen the authority of the torone.... At first their efforts met with harsh suppression, in literati purges aimed at the sarim as a group.... But at last, after Sŏnjo came to the throne in 1567, the sarim yangban were able to seize power.<sup>3</sup>

All three of the sources cited above tell us explicitly and with complete certainty that a group of scholar-officials identifiable as the sarim faction, or the sarim force, came to dominate Yi dynasty politics by some time in the reign of Sŏnjo, that is by the end of the 16th century. The first writer focuses his as the sarim faction, or the sarim force, came to dominate wielded its power -- principally through the activities of the censoring bodies that it controlled. The other two citations present a more specific case, centered on the geographical, economic, and ideological or scholarly orientation of the so-called sarim. Many other contemporary survey histories and monographs deal with the question of the character and composition of the ruling elite of the

---

3. Democratic Peoples Republic of Korea, Academy of Social Sciences, Institute of History, Dictionary of History (Ryŏksa sajŏn 歷史事典), P'yŏngyang: 1971, II, p. 10.

Yi dynasty in similar fashion. Among those that I have seen only one, a short and rather theoretical essay, attempts explicitly to discuss the sarim in the context of Yi political history after 1600.<sup>4</sup> All writers on the subject appear to take note of the Neo-Confucian ideological commitment of the sarim, and all characterize the originally dominant political force that the sarim attacked and eventually overcame as the "bureaucrat-scholar element" (kwanhakp'a), or the "established meritorious element" (hun'gup'a). But I have not yet found a study that attempts to discuss these apparently discrete forces in terms of the individuals who comprised the two constituencies at crucial periods in their struggle for power, or thus with specific reference to the implications such an inquiry must have for analysis of Yi Korea's ruling elite Structure in both the pre-1600 and post-1600 periods.

My own research on the question of sarim vs. non-sarim forces has not proceeded far enough, by any means, for me to propose satisfactory solutions to the many problems that beset this issue. Nevertheless, I am convinced that the sarim hypothesis has overlooked certain fundamental facts that must be taken into account in developing any view of the nature of the dominant political force, the ruling elite class, in the Yi dynasty. I believe I

---

4. Yi T'ae-jin 李泰鎮 "Simnyuk segi sarim 'ui yöksajök sŏngkyök 十六世紀 士林의 歷史的 性格 (The historical character of the 16th century sarim), Taedong munhwa yŏn'gu 13 (1979), pp. 106-111, 132-135.

can point out some directions that further research on this problem must take. And I can offer, very tentatively, the beginnings of a different kind of analysis of the composition of the Yi dynasty ruling class.

I am not certain when the sarim interpretation first appeared in recent Korean historiography. Probably Dr. Yi Pyŏng-do was one of the earliest to use it as a tool of analysis. He noted that there were four "factions" or "schools (p'a 派)" in 15th century Korea -- the hun'gup'a, chŏrŭip'a 節義派 ("school of principle"), ch'ŏngdamp'a 清談派 ("school of disinterested discourse"), and sarimp'a, and he wrote about the confrontation between the hun'gup'a and the sarimp'a.<sup>5</sup> Before that, Dr. Sin Sŏk-ho had written about the "conflict between the new and established officials" in the reign of Sŏngjong (1469-1494), which is another way of describing the same phenomenon.<sup>6</sup> But neither of these scholars made mention of the socio-economic background or base of the sarim force, nor did they go on to characterize the sarim as the dominant force in later Yi dynasty politics.

It behooves us, then, to look more closely at exactly who was

- 
5. Yi Pyŏng-do 李丙壽, Kuksa taegwan 國史大觀 (Survey of Korean history), Seoul: Pomun'gak, 1955, p. 381.
  6. Sin Sŏk-ho 申奭鎬, "Chōsen Seisō jidai no shin-kyū tairitsu" 朝鮮成宗 時代の新舊對立 (The conflict between the incoming and the established officials in the time of Sŏngjong), in Kindai Chōsen shi kenkyū, Keijō: 1944, pp. 303-406.

involved, on the sarim side, in two or three specific confrontations, or controversies, during the Sŏngjong-Chungjong period.

When Sŏngjong died in 1494, his successor Yŏnsan'gun routinely commanded that Buddhist funeral rites be performed for him, as had been the case with all Yi dynasty kings up to that time. The censoring bodies objected strongly, and some officials in the Office of Special Counselors (Hongmun'gwan 弘文館) even refused to compose the required texts to accompany the rites. Backed by Sŏngjong's widowed queen and by such high officials as No Sa-sin 盧思愼, Yŏnsan'gun ordered the Royal Secretariat (Sŭngjŏngwŏn 承政院) to bring no further protests to his attention. At this point a large number of students in the National Confucian Academy (Sŏnggyun'gwan 成均館) launched a violent attack on Buddhism in general and on No Sa-sin, then the Second State Councillor, in particular. But Yŏnsan'gun's reaction was to have 157 of the students arrested, and before long he banished three of them and barred 21 others from taking the higher civil service examinations (munkwa 文科).

It is significant to examine who these punished students were and what happened to some of them later, since all of them were pardoned within a year after the incident. With regard to the three ringleaders who were banished, Yi Mok 李穆 and Chŏng Hŭi-ryang 鄭希良 became major victims of the Purge of 1498, and Yi

Cha-hwa 李自華 became a minor victim of the Purge of 1504. Kim Ch'öl-lyöng 金千齡 and Im Hüi-jae 任熙載 (the son of the great villain of 1504) died in the 1504 purge. Pak Kwang-yöng 朴光榮, Yun Wön 尹源, Yu Hüi-jö 柳希渚, and Cho Yu-hyöng 趙有亨 all suffered in some degree in the Purge of 1504. Kim Su-gyöng 金壽卿 and Söng Mong-jöng 成夢井 both became merit subjects (kongsin 功臣) when Chungjong was enthroned in 1506. Sim Chöng 沈貞 also became a merit subject at the same time and is notorious as a major architect of the Purge of 1519. Söng Uin 成雲 also was among the purgers in 1519, but Yi Söng-dong 李成童 was among the victims. Han Hyo-wön 韓効元 became Chief State Councillor in the middle years of Chungjong's reign.

The point is that this controversy was fundamentally an ideological one. To some extent, of course, it was a conflict between the higher ranking, established officials and the rising, next generation of officials. This sort of tension between old and new generations of officials is a common phenomenon, a phenomenon seen in many different cultures and in many different historical periods. At this time in Yi Korea this natural conflict was sharpened by the existence of an ideological gap as well as a generation gap. But it seems clear that such factors as geographical or socio-economic background played little or no part in the controversy over Buddhist rites for Söngjong.

Let us look next at the victims of the Purge of 1498, which generally is described as a purge of the disciples of Kim Chong-jik. It is certainly true that the core element of those officials who were purged in 1498 were disciples of Kim Chong-jik. But as I would analyze the Purge of 1498, Kim Chong-jik and his disciples were symbolic victims. They symbolized an institutional development -- the growth of the power of the censoring bodies -- that was considered highly improper and dangerous by Yönsan'gun and many of his high officials. If the particular issue of Kim Il-son's 金駟孫 history draft had not arisen, I think it quite likely that another issue would have been found, and perhaps then the purge would have focused on a different group of officials who had abused the function of remonstrance. In this connection it should be noted that, although 18 disciples of Kim Chong-jik were punished in 1498, 12 others who were named as disciples by Kim Il-son were not punished. It have not yet been able to investigate this point, but it seems likely that a correlation will be found between the degree of activity as a censor and the decision to punish a particular disciple or not.

Finally, let us examine two aspects of the Purge of 1519. One of the most important measures in Cho Kwang-jo's 趙光祖 reform program was the hyö'llyangkwa 賢良科 ("examination for the sage and good"). This was a radical proposal aimed at recruiting

new officials by a recommendation process rather than by the usual step by step process of the civil service examinations. The term sarim does not seem to have been used in the debate on the hyölli hyölli yangkwa proposal, although the term yuil chi sa 遺逸之士 ("idle literati") appears. However, there should be no question that the so-called sarim, among whom Cho Kwang-jo himself is regarded as the archetypal figure, were the target group that Cho Kwang-jo and his followers wanted to recruit. At any rate, after a heated debate, Chungjong swept aside the objections of many of his high officials and ordered officials in the capital and in the provinces to recommend men of learning and upright conduct. This was done, and a year after it was first proposed the Yi dynasty's only hyölli yangkwa (also known as ch'on'gökwa 薦舉科, or "recommendation examination") was held and 28 men were awarded the "crimson certificate" of the successful candidate.

What was the geographical and family background of these 28 successful candidates" If it is agreed that these men can properly be called representatives of the sarim, then we thus may discover, in part, what the characteristics of the sarim are -- or at least, negatively, what does not characterize the sarim.

As for their geographical background, 19 of the 28 lived in Seoul, including 15 of the first 16 in order of rank on the examination; 5 lived in Kyöngsang province; and one each lived in

Kyönggi, Chölla, Hwanghae, and Kangwön provinces. Accordingly, it may be suggested that a higher proportion of hyöllyangkwa candidate were members of, or close to, the capital bureaucracy than was the case in the normal higher civil service examinations.

At this stage in my research I can discuss the family background of the successful hyöllyangkwa candidates only in terms of the official careers of their immediate forbears or close kinsmen. Among the 28, 12 have two among their "three ancestors" (father, grandfather, great-grandfather) who passed the munkwa. Seven others have one among their "three ancestors," or an uncle, or an established older brother who passed the munkwa. Six more have rather important or influential family connections within the preceding two generations, such as a father-in-law who was a grandson of King Sejong. Only three seem to have only low-ranking close kinsmen (although further research may well reduce this small number to zero), and one of these is a great-great-grandson of Yi Wön 李原, an early Yi merit subject and Second State Councillor.

In short, the products of the hyöllyangkwa were representative members of the existing bureaucratic establishment. And in this respect they were very much like the force that brought them into being -- the force of "men of 1519" led by Cho Kwang-jo. These too were a substantially Seoul-centered group with strong

ties to the existing official order. For example, six among the eight primary victims of the Purge of 1519 were men of Seoul, including Cho Kwang-jo, the other two being residents of Ch'olla province. One of the Ch'olla residents, Kim Ku 金絺, came from an extraordinarily successful munkwa background -- his grandfather, great-grandfather, great-great-grandfather and four of his father's brothers all passed the munkwa. Cho Kwang-jo's grandfather and two of his uncles passed the munkwa, and his great-great-grandfather Cho On 趙溫 was a leading Dynastic Establishment Merit Subject. Pak Hun 朴薰 represents the fourth successive generation to be successful in the munkwa, and two uncles also had passed the munkwa and had had distinguished careers. Ki Chun's 奇遵 father, an uncle, and an older brother all passed the munkwa. Yun Cha-im's 尹自任 father passed the munkwa under Sŏngjong and served at the board minister level.

Accordingly, the conclusion is inescapable that the so-called "men of 1519" cannot be distinguished from other power groups on the basis of geographical or social background. What does distinguish them, then? It was their ideology of Neo-Confucianism, in particular their extreme commitment to Neo-Confucian principles of statecraft and moral conduct, that set apart the "men of 1519," and their forerunners in the reigns of Sŏngjong and Yŏnsan'gun, from their contemporaries. Thus it is devotion to Neo-Confucianist

ideology and determination to shape the conduct of Yi dynasty government in accordance with its principles that mark and define the so-called sarim.

Among modern Korean historians who have attempted to deal with the sarim issue, perhaps the late Dr. Yi Sang-baek 李相佰 has suggested most clearly what the term sarim really means. In his Han'guk sa Künse chön'gi p'yön (History of Korea: Early Modern Period), in a section titled "Literati Purges, Factional Strife, and the Sarim" he writes:

Political strife in the period marked by the literati purges differed in a number of ways from that earlier in the dynasty, and the fact that political factions or cliques came to have an ongoing character may be cited as the major such difference. This is not to say that political groupings were formed for the purpose of achieving some objective. It was rather the case that an entity or force called the sarim, espousing the ideology of the Neo-Confucian school, put down roots in both the capital and the provincial areas, and maintained its viability in the face of recurrent political vicissitudes. The sarim, then, entered the political arena and, in its frequent clashes with the quondam forces that opposed it, was the victim of repeated purges.<sup>7</sup>

---

7. Yi Sang-baek 李相佰, Han'guk sa Künse chön'gi p'yön 韓國史近世前期篇, Seoul: Oryu Munhwasa, 1962, p. 563.

In this passage is found the fundamental characteristic that identifies the so-called sarim, its devotion to Neo-Confucianist principles. Dr. Yi also describes the sarim as a force with roots both in the capital and in the countryside. As I have indicated earlier, I would go considerably farther than this and suggest that the sarim were essentially a Seoul-based, central government based, force that continuously extended its roots from the capital area out into the countryside, especially into the areas of Kyŏnggi, the western edge of Kangwŏn, and Ch'ungch'ŏng provinces that lie within reasonable communication and travel time from Seoul. In the early period of the Yi dynasty one segment of the sarim (and in terms of long-run political power not a very important segment) arose from its original base in the countryside, entered the officialdom through the examination process, and for about one century competed with fair success for major central government positions. These rural Neo-Confucianist literati, especially those from North Kyŏngsang province, may have taken the lead, very briefly, in espousing and spreading the still undigested ideology of Neo-Confucianism, but they never were a distinct political force. Even when they were at the peak of their political strength, in the reigns of Sŏngjong and Yŏnsan'gun, their position in the central government relied heavily on the cooperation and support of like-minded Seoul-based scholar-officials. And as the Neo-Confucian

ideology and principles of statecraft rapidly took hold throughout the whole of the scholar-official class, that segment having roots only in the countryside soon was submerged in the tide of the longer and more deeply rooted force of scholar-officials who lived in the heartland area of Seoul and its surrounding counties.

What I have been trying to demonstrate above is that the term sarim may be useful in describing the nature of a vitally important ideological movement in the early Yi dynasty, but it is definitely not a useful term in analyzing the actual composition of the Yi dynasty ruling elite. If I may make this statement in an extreme way, then I would argue that, from the standpoint of the composition of the Yi dynasty ruling class, it is meaningless to say -- in the words of the historian I quoted when I began: "The political world of the Yi dynasty was dominated by the sarim." Again, from the standpoint of the actual composition of the Yi dynasty ruling elite, it would be equally meaningless to say that the Yi political process was dominated by the sadaebu (literati 士大夫), or by the yangban class. Of course the sarim were not from the beginning of the Yi dynasty the exact equivalent of the yangban or sadaebu. But after the Neo-Confucian ideology became established as the dominant mode of thought, and as the exclusive ideological basis for Yi dynasty government, then the terms sarim, sadaebu, and yangban became freely interchangeable.

In this connection I have noticed an interesting fact. In the index volume to the Chosŏn wangjo sillok 朝鮮王朝實錄 (Annals of the Yi dynasty) there is only one item or heading beginning with the term sarim, and that is "sarim calamity (or purge)." The first entry is for the year 1515, the same year that Cho Kwang-jo passed the munkwa and emerged as a force in the central government. There are 75 citations between 1515 and 1564, the period from the time when the Purge of 1519 began to take shape to the time when the aftershocks of the Purge of 1545 finally subsided. After this period, to the very end of the dynasty, there are only eight more citations under this heading.

No doubt there are deficiencies in the Annals index volume with regard to coverage of the term sarim. Nevertheless, it may be justifiable to draw certain tentative conclusions from the way the term sarim is indexed. First, the sarim were not identified contemporarily as a distinct group or force by that name for about half a century after they first are said to have emerged. Secondly, when the sarim finally came to be identified it was as a group of scholar-officials who were made to suffer as a consequence of the political ideology they advocated and the political actions they took while serving as officials in the central government. These men were not a distinct force in terms of geographical or social background; there are no headings in the Annals index

titled "rural sarim" or "countryside sarim," nor can we find headings like "established meritorious element" or "bureaucrat-scholar element" in the Annals index volume. Thirdly, the virtual disappearance of the term sarim after being in use for only fifty years suggests that it became no longer useful in distinguishing one ideological stream from another. The actual composition of the ruling class had not changed in any significant way, other than to diminish the political role of those sarim who had only local or regional roots. It was the political ideology that had changed, since by the end of My'ongjong's reign in 1567 Neo-Confucian ideology was the shared belief of all members of the ruling class. In short, the Annals index volume lends support to the notion that the sarim had become synonymous with the sadaebu or yangban as a term for the entirety of the ruling elite of the Yi dynasty.

At the beginning of this presentation I promised to "offer, very tentatively, the beginnings of a different kind of analysis of the composition of the Yi dynasty ruling class." Briefly, the following is what I had in mind.

Two years ago a new and extremely valuable source material became available for research for the first time. I am referring to the 16th century Munhwa Yu-ssi sebo 文化柳氏世譜 (Genealogy of the Munhwa Yu clan), which was republished by the Munhwa Yu clan headquarters in Seoul in July, 1979. This genealogy was compiled

over a twenty year period during the reign of Myōngjong and originally was published in 1565. It is not a *chokpo* 族譜 ("clan genealogy") in the usual style of later Yi dynasty genealogies but rather may be called a multi-clan genealogy. That is, the purpose of its compiler was to include, of course, all male-line descendants of the first ancestor or founder of the Munhwa Yu clan, but also to include all female-line descendants as well. Accordingly, in the case of Munhwa Yu daughters, this genealogy attempts to record not only her sons and daughters but, in turn, all of their descendants down to the time the genealogy was compiled. Thus it is a kind of comprehensive genealogy, although to be sure limited to those who had direct or indirect marriage connections with the Munhwa Yu family.

In an effort to find out more about the actual individual members of the early Yi dynasty ruling class, I have tried to locate all successful munkwa candidates who appear in this work. The results of this research seem to me to be highly significant. And here I would like to summarize my findings as they relate to some of the problems I have discussed above.

First let us look at the overall statistics. In the critical 75 year period during which the sarim are said to have emerged as a powerful force in the central government, fully 70% of all those who passed the munkwa can be found in this Munhwa Yu genealogy.

The percentage is a little lower, 66%, for those who passed the regular triennial examinations, and it is a little higher, 74%, for those who passed the various kinds of special examinations. And it must be understood clearly that these statistics include only those candidates who appear as members of their won clan lineages or who appear as sons-in-law of other families, and in probably a majority of cases a particular candidate appears in both these capacities. In other words these percentages do not include those candidates who have less direct connections with the Munhwa Yu and their related families. For example, a candidate who does not appear himself may have an uncle, or a son, or a daughter, or other close kinsman who have marriage connections recorded in this genealogy.

I have already discussed above one aspect of the family background of the 28 men who passed Cho Kwang-jo's hyöillyangkwa. They also are a remarkable group when examined from the standpoint of inclusion in the 1565 Munhwa Yu genealogy, for 26 of the 28 are found there. It is equally remarkable that 7 of the 8 primary victims of the Purge of 1519 are in this genealogy, and with regard to the only exception, Kim Ku, among four of his father's brothers who passed the munkwa, two are found in this genealogy. Finally, not long after the Purge of 1519 began, a list of 35 supporters of Cho Kwang-jo was drawn up as a basis for expanding

the scope of the purge beyond its initial rather hesitant limits. Among these 35 men, 30 are found in the 1565 Munhwa Yu genealogy.

These facts suggest that, from near the beginning of the Yi dynasty, the ruling elite was a considerably more homogeneous group than we historians of Korea have thought. Accordingly, it appears likely that more fruitful results will be obtained by trying to analyze the Yi ruling class as a unitary, ongoing entity than as one formed through the clash of two disparate forces.